

Gromov's macroscopic dimension conjecture

DMITRY V BOLOTOV

In this note we construct a closed 4-manifold having torsion-free fundamental group and whose universal covering is of macroscopic dimension 3. This yields a counterexample to Gromov's conjecture about the falling of macroscopic dimension.

[57R19](#); [57R20](#)

1 Introduction

The following definition was given by M Gromov [2]:

Definition 1.1 Let V be a metric space. We say that $\dim_\varepsilon V \leq k$ if there is a k -dimensional polyhedron P and a proper uniformly cobounded map $\phi: V \rightarrow P$ such that $\text{Diam}(\phi^{-1}(p)) \leq \varepsilon$ for all $p \in P$. A metric space V has macroscopic $\dim_{\text{mc}} V \leq k$ if $\dim_\varepsilon V \leq k$ for some possibly large $\varepsilon < \infty$. If k is minimal, we say that $\dim_{\text{mc}} V = k$.

Gromov also stated the following questions which, for convenience, we state in the form of conjectures:

C1 Let (M^n, g) be a closed Riemannian n -manifold with torsion-free fundamental group, and let (\tilde{M}^n, \tilde{g}) be the universal covering of M^n with the pullback metric. Suppose that $\dim_{\text{mc}}(\tilde{M}^n, \tilde{g}) < n$. Then $\dim_{\text{mc}}(\tilde{M}^n, \tilde{g}) < n - 1$.

In [1] we proved **C1** for the case $n = 3$.

Evidently, the following conjecture would imply **C1** (see also **(C)** of [Section 2](#)):

C2 Let M^n be a closed n -manifold with torsion-free fundamental group π and let $f: M^n \rightarrow B\pi$ be a classifying map to the classifying space $B\pi$. Suppose that f is homotopic to a mapping into the $(n - 1)$ -skeleton of $B\pi$. Then f is in fact homotopic to a mapping into the $(n - 2)$ -skeleton of $B\pi$.

In this note we show that both conjectures fail for $n \geq 4$.

We always assume that universal covering are equipped with the pullback metrics.

Framed cobordism, Pontryagin manifolds and classification of mappings to the sphere

Let M be a smooth compact manifold possibly with a boundary and let (N, v) and (N', w) be closed n -submanifolds in the interior of M with trivial normal bundles and framings v and w , respectively.

Definition 1.2 Two framed submanifolds (N, v) and (N', w) are *framed cobordant* if there exists a cobordism $X \subset M \times [0, 1]$ between N and N' and a framing u of X such that

$$\begin{aligned} u(x, t) &= (v(x), 0) & \text{for } (x, t) \in N \times [0, \varepsilon), \\ u(x, t) &= (w(x), 1) & \text{for } (x, t) \in N' \times (1 - \varepsilon, 1]. \end{aligned}$$

Remark 1.3 If $(N', w) = \emptyset$ we say (N, v) is *framed cobordant to zero*.

Now let $f: M \rightarrow S^p$ be a smooth mapping and $y \in S^p$ be a regular value of f . Then f induces the following framing of the submanifold $f^{-1}(y) \subset M$. Choose a positively oriented basis $v = (v^1, \dots, v^p)$ for the tangent space $T(S^p)_y$. Notice that for each $x \in f^{-1}(y)$ the differential $df_x: TM_x \rightarrow T(S^p)_y$ vanishes on the subspace $Tf^{-1}(y)_x$ and isomorphically maps its orthogonal complement $Tf^{-1}(y)_x^\perp$ onto $T(S^p)_y$. Hence there exists a unique vector

$$w^i \in Tf^{-1}(y)_x^\perp \subset TM_x$$

which is mapped by df_x to v^i . So we have an induced framing $w = f^*v$ of $f^{-1}(y)$.

Definition 1.4 This framed manifold $(f^{-1}(y), f^*v)$ will be called the *Pontryagin manifold* associated with f .

Theorem 1.5 (Milnor [3]) *If y' is another regular value of f and v' is a positively oriented basis for $T(S^p)_{y'}$, then the framed manifold $(f^{-1}(y'), f^*v')$ is framed cobordant to $(f^{-1}(y), f^*v)$.*

Theorem 1.6 (Milnor [3]) *Two mappings from $(M, \partial M)$ to (S^p, s_0) are smoothly homotopic if and only if the associated Pontryagin manifolds are framed cobordant.*

2 The construction of an example

Consider a circle bundle $S^3 \times S^1 \rightarrow S^2 \times S^1$ obtained by multiplying the Hopf circle bundle $S^3 \rightarrow S^2$ by S^1 . Take also the trivial circle bundle $T^4 = S^1 \times T^3 \rightarrow T^3$ and produce a connected sum

$$M^4 = S^3 \times S^1 \#_{S^1} T^4$$

of these circle bundles along small tubes consisting of the circle fibers equipped with natural trivialization. Clearly

(A) M^4 is the total space of the circle bundle

$$p: M^4 \rightarrow M^3 = S^2 \times S^1 \# T^3;$$

(B) $\pi_1(M^4) = \pi_1(M^3)$. Denote this group by π ;

(C) $B\pi = S^1 \vee T^3$ and $\dim_{\text{mc}} M^4 \leq 3$. Indeed, the classifying map $f: M^4 \rightarrow B\pi$ can be lifted to the proper cobounded (by $\text{Diam}(M^4)$) map $\tilde{f}: \tilde{M}^4 \rightarrow \widetilde{B\pi}$ of the universal coverings;

(D) the classifying map $f: M^4 \rightarrow B\pi$ can be defined as the composition

$$M^4 \xrightarrow{p} S^2 \times S^1 \# T^3 \xrightarrow{f_1} S^2 \times S^1 \vee T^3 \xrightarrow{f_2} S^1 \vee T^3,$$

where f_1 is a quotient map which maps a separating sphere S^2 to a point, and f_2 is the mapping which coincides with the projection onto the generating circle of $S^2 \times S^1$ and is the identity on T^3 -component.

Let $g: S^1 \vee T^3 \rightarrow S^3$ be a degree one map which maps S^1 to a point. Then the following composition $J = g \circ f_2 \circ f_1: M^3 \rightarrow S^3$ also has degree one.

Theorem 2.1 *The mapping $f: M^4 \rightarrow B\pi$ is not homotopic into the 2-skeleton of $B\pi$.*

Proof Let $\pi: E \rightarrow M^3$ be a two-dimensional vector bundle associated with the circle bundle $p: M^4 \rightarrow M^3$. Let E_0 denote E without zero section $s: M^3 \hookrightarrow E$ and $j: M^4 \hookrightarrow E_0$ be a unit circle subbundle of E .

The following diagram is homotopically commutative:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} M^4 & \xrightarrow{j} & E_0 \\ \downarrow p & & \downarrow \text{embedding} \\ M^3 & \xrightarrow{s} & E \end{array}$$

Obviously, j and s are homotopy equivalences.

Recall that we have the Thom isomorphism (see Milnor and Stasheff [4])

$$\Phi: H^k(M^3; \Lambda) \rightarrow H^{k+2}(E, E_0; \Lambda)$$

defined by

$$\Phi(x) = (\pi^* x) \cup u,$$

where Λ is a ring with unity, and u denotes the Thom class.

The Thom class u has the following properties [4]:

- (a) If e is the Euler class of E then we have the Thom–Wu formula

$$\Phi(e) = u \cup u.$$

- (b) $s^*(u) = e$.

Let

$$M_p = M^4 \times I / (x \times 1 \sim p(x))$$

be the cylinder of the map $p: M^4 \rightarrow M^3$. Then we have natural embeddings

$$i_1: M^4 \rightarrow M^4 \times 0 \subset M_p \quad \text{and} \quad i_2: M^3 \rightarrow M^3 \times 1 \subset M_p$$

and a natural retraction $r: M_p \rightarrow M^3$. It is easy to see that M_p is just a D^2 -bundle associated to the circle bundle $p: M^4 \rightarrow M^3$ and $r|_{M^4} = p$.

Recall that the Thom space $(T(E), \infty)$ is the one point compactification of E . Denote $T(E)$ by T . Clearly, T is homeomorphic to the quotient space M_p/M^4 and

$$(1) \quad H^*(T, \infty; \Lambda) \cong H^*(E, E_0; \Lambda)$$

is a ring isomorphism (see Milnor and Stasheff [4] for more details).

If $g \circ f: M^4 \rightarrow S^3$ is nullhomotopic then we can extend the map $J: M^3 \times 1 \rightarrow S^3$ to a mapping $G: T \rightarrow S^3$. This means that the composition

$$M^3 \xrightarrow{i_2} M_p \xrightarrow{\text{quotient}} T \xrightarrow{G} S^3$$

has degree 1 and $G^*: H^3(S^3, s_0; \Lambda) \rightarrow H^3(T, \infty; \Lambda)$ is nontrivial.

Let $a \in H^*(E, E_0; \Lambda)$ denote a class corresponding to the class $G^*(\bar{s})$ by isomorphism (1), where \bar{s} is a generator of $H^3(S^3, \Lambda)$.

Let us consider the following exact sequence of pair :

$$H^3(E, E_0; \Lambda) \xrightarrow{\xi} H^3(E; \Lambda) \xrightarrow{\psi} H^3(E_0; \Lambda)$$

Since E is homotopy equivalent to M^3 , we have $H^i(E; \Lambda) = H^i(M^3; \Lambda)$. Clearly $s^*\xi(a) = J^*(\bar{s})$. (Note that $J^*(\bar{s})$ is a generator of $H^3(M^3; \Lambda)$).

Let us note that $e \bmod 2$ is equal to the Stiefel–Whitney class w_2 which is nonzero. Indeed, the restriction of E onto the embedded sphere $i: S^2 \subset M^3$ is the vector bundle

associated with the Hopf circle bundle, and so $i^*w_2 \neq 0$. By the Thom construction above there exists a class $z \in H^1(M^3; \mathbb{Z}_2)$ such that $\Phi(z) = a$. Thus

$$s^*\xi(a) = z \cup w_2 = \{\text{generator of } H^3(M^3; \mathbb{Z}_2)\}.$$

Recall the basic properties of Steenrod squares [6; 4]:

- (1) For each n, i and $Y \subset X$ there exists an additive homomorphism

$$\text{Sq}^i: H^n(X, Y; \mathbb{Z}_2) \rightarrow H^{n+i}(X, Y; \mathbb{Z}_2).$$

- (2) If $f: (X, Y) \rightarrow (X', Y')$ is a continuous map of pairs, then

$$\text{Sq}^i \circ f^* = f^* \circ \text{Sq}^i.$$

- (3) If $a \in H^n(X, Y; \mathbb{Z}_2)$, then $\text{Sq}^0(a) = a$, $\text{Sq}^n(a) = a \cup a$ and $\text{Sq}^i(a) = 0$ for $i > n$.

- (4) We have Cartan's formula:

$$\text{Sq}^k(a \cup b) = \sum_{i+j=k} \text{Sq}^i(a) \cup \text{Sq}^j(b).$$

- (5) $\text{Sq}^1 = w_1 \cup: H^{m-1}(M; \mathbb{Z}_2) \rightarrow H^m(M; \mathbb{Z}_2)$, where M is a closed smooth manifold and w_1 is the first Stiefel–Whitney class of the tangent bundle TM . This follows from the coincidence of the class w_1 with the first Wu class v_1 [4]. It is well known that $w_1 = 0$ if M is an orientable manifold.

Let us show that $\text{Sq}^2(\Phi(z)) \neq 0$. Using the properties above, it is easy to see that $\text{Sq}^1(z) = \text{Sq}^2(z) = 0$. Using the Thom–Wu formula (a), we have

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Sq}^2(\Phi(z)) &= \pi_* z \cup \text{Sq}^2(u) \\ &= \pi_* z \cup u \cup u \\ &= \pi_* z \cup \Phi(w_2) = \Phi(z \cup w_2) \neq 0. \end{aligned}$$

Whence $0 = G^*(\text{Sq}^2(\bar{s})) = \text{Sq}^2(G^*(\bar{s})) \neq 0$. This contradiction implies that the composition $g \circ f: M^4 \rightarrow S^3$ is not homotopic to zero and $f: M^4 \rightarrow B\pi$ can not be deformed into the 2–skeleton of $B\pi$. \square

Corollary 2.2 *The Pontryagin manifold $(p^{-1}(m), p^*(w))$ is not cobordant to zero, where (m, w) is any framed point of M^3 .*

Proof Indeed, from Theorem 2.1 and Theorem 1.6 it follows that if $s \in S^3$ is a regular point of $g \circ f: M^4 \rightarrow S^3$, then the Pontryagin manifold $(f^{-1}(g^{-1}(s)), f^*(g^*(v)))$ is not cobordant to zero, where v is a framing at s . Thus the Pontryagin manifold

$(p^{-1}(m), p^*(w))$ for $(m, w) = (J^{-1}(s), (J^*(v)))$ is also not cobordant to zero. Now the statement follows from [Theorem 1.5](#) and regularity of the map $p: M^4 \rightarrow M^3$. \square

3 The main theorem

Definition 3.1 A metric space is called uniformly contractible (UC) if there exists an increasing function $Q: \mathbb{R}_+ \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_+$ such that each ball of radius r contracts to a point inside a ball of radius $Q(r)$.

It is well known that the universal covering of a compact $K(\tau, 1)$ space is UC (see Gromov [\[2\]](#) for more details).

Denote by ρ the distance function on $\widetilde{B\pi}$.

Lemma 3.2 Let $\tilde{f}: \widetilde{M}^4 \rightarrow \widetilde{B\pi}$ be a lifting of a classifying map to the universal coverings. If $\dim_{\text{mc}} \widetilde{M}^4 \leq 2$, then there exists a short homotopy $\tilde{F}: \widetilde{M}^4 \times I \rightarrow \widetilde{B\pi}$ of \tilde{f} such that $\tilde{F}(x, 0) = \tilde{f}(x)$ and $\tilde{F}(x, 1)$ is a through mapping

$$\tilde{F}(x, 1): \widetilde{M}^4 \rightarrow P^2 \rightarrow \widetilde{B\pi},$$

where P^2 is a 2-dimensional polyhedron and “short homotopy” means that we have $\rho(\tilde{f}(x), \tilde{F}(x, t)) \leq \text{const}$ for each $x \in \widetilde{M}^4$, $t \in I$.

Proof Let $h: \widetilde{M}^4 \rightarrow P$ be a proper cobounded continuous map to some 2-dimensional polyhedron P . Using a simplicial approximation of h , we can suppose that h is a simplicial map between such triangulations of \widetilde{M}^4 and P , that the preimage of the star of each vertex is uniformly bounded (recall that h is proper). Since \tilde{f} is a quasi-isometry, the \tilde{f} -image $\tilde{f}(h^{-1}(St(v)))$ of the preimage of the star of each vertex $v \in P$ is bounded by some constant d . Let M_h be the cylinder of h with natural triangulation consisting of the triangulations of \widetilde{M}^4 and P and the triangulations of the simplices $\{v_0, \dots, v_k, h(v_k), \dots, h(v_p)\}$, where $\{v_0, \dots, v_p\}$ is a simplex in \widetilde{M}^4 with $v_0 < v_1 < \dots < v_p$ [\[5\]](#).

Consider the map $\tilde{f}_0: (M_h)^0 \rightarrow \widetilde{B\pi}$ from 0-skeleton $(M_h)^0$ of M_h which coincides with \tilde{f} on the lower base of $(M_h)^0$ and with the composition $\tilde{f} \circ t_0$ on the upper base of $(M_h)^0$, where $t_0: (P)^0 \rightarrow \widetilde{M}^4$ is a section of h defined on the 0-skeleton $(P)^0$ of P . Since $\widetilde{B\pi}$ is uniformly contractible, we can extend \tilde{f}_0 to M_h using the function Q of the definition of UC-spaces as follows:

By the construction above, \tilde{f}_0 -image of every two neighbouring vertexes of M_h lies into a ball of radius d . Therefore we can extend the map \tilde{f}_0 to a mapping

$\tilde{f}_1: (M_h)^1 \rightarrow \widetilde{B\pi}$ such that $\rho(\tilde{f}(x), \tilde{f}_1(x, t)) \leq d$, $x \in (\widetilde{M^4})^0$. The \tilde{f}_1 -image of the boundary of arbitrary 2-simplex of M_h lies into a ball of radius $3d$. So we can extend \tilde{f}_1 to a mapping $\tilde{f}_2: (M_h)^2 \rightarrow \widetilde{B\pi}$ so that $\rho(\tilde{f}(x), \tilde{f}_2(x, t)) \leq 4Q(3d)$, $x \in (\widetilde{M^4})^1$. Similarly, continue \tilde{f}_2 to mappings $\tilde{f}_3, \dots, \tilde{f}_5$ defined on skeletons $(M_h)^3, \dots, (M_h)^5 = M_h$ respectively, so that $\rho(\tilde{f}(x), \tilde{f}_5(x, t)) \leq c$, where c is a constant. \square

Main Theorem $\dim_{\text{mc}} \widetilde{M^4} = 3$.

Proof Let $q: \widetilde{B\pi} \rightarrow \widetilde{B\pi}/(\widetilde{B\pi} \setminus D^3) \cong S^3$ be a quotient map, where D^3 is an embedded open 3-dimensional ball.

Suppose that $\dim_{\text{mc}} \widetilde{M^4} \leq 2$ and let $h: \widetilde{M^4} \rightarrow P$ be a proper cobounded continuous map to some 2-dimensional polyhedron P as in Lemma 3.2. It is not difficult to find a compact smooth submanifold with boundary $W \subset \widetilde{M^4}$ such that W contains a ball of arbitrary fixed radius r . Since \tilde{f} is a quasi-isometry, using Lemma 3.2 we can choose r big enough such that $\widetilde{D^3} \subset \tilde{f}(W)$ and $\tilde{F}(\partial W \times I) \cap \widetilde{D^3} = \emptyset$, where \tilde{F} denotes the short homotopy from Lemma 3.2. Thus we have a homotopy

$$q \circ \tilde{F}: (W, \partial W) \times I \rightarrow (S^3, s_0)$$

which maps $\partial W \times I$ into the base point s_0 . Since $\dim P = 2$, from Lemma 3.2 it follows that $q \circ \tilde{F}(x, 1)$ is homotopic to zero. Therefore $q \circ \tilde{F}(x, 0) = q \circ \tilde{f}$ is homotopic to zero (and $q \circ \tilde{f}$ is smoothly homotopic to zero [3]). Let (s, v) be a framed regular point in S^3 for the map $q \circ \tilde{f}$. Then the Pontryagin manifold

$$(\tilde{f}^{-1} \circ q^{-1}(s), \tilde{f}^* q^*(v))$$

must be cobordant to zero (see Theorem 1.6). Let $(\widetilde{\Omega}, w)$ be a framed nullcobordism which is embedded in $W \times I$ with the boundary $(\tilde{f}^{-1} \circ q^{-1}(s), \tilde{f}^* q^*(v))$.

Consider the covering map $\tau: \widetilde{M^4} \times I \rightarrow M^4 \times I$. Then $\tau(\tilde{f}^{-1} \circ q^{-1}(s), \tilde{f}^* q^*(v))$ is an embedded framed submanifold of M^4 which coincides with the Pontryagin manifold $(p^{-1}(m), p^*(v))$ of some framed point $(m, v) \in M^3$. And $\tau(\widetilde{\Omega}, w)$ is an immersed framed submanifold of $M^4 \times I$. Using the Whitney Embedding Theorem [7], we can make a small perturbation of $\tau(\widetilde{\Omega}, w)$ identically on the small collar of the boundary to obtain a framed nullcobordism with the boundary $\tau(\tilde{f}^{-1} \circ q^{-1}(s), \tilde{f}^* q^*(v))$. But this is impossible by Corollary 2.2. \square

Remark 3.3 By similar arguments one can prove that

$$\dim_{\text{mc}}(\widetilde{M^4 \times T^p}) = p + 3.$$

Question Does $M^4 \times T^p$ admit a PSC–metric for some p ?

Acknowledgements I thank Professor Gromov for useful discussions and attention to this work during my visit to the IHES in December 2005. Also I thank the referee for the useful remarks and S Maksimenko for the help in preparation of the article.

References

- [1] **D V Bolotov**, *Macroscopic dimension of 3-manifolds*, Math. Phys. Anal. Geom. 6 (2003) 291–299 [MR1997917](#)
- [2] **M Gromov**, *Positive curvature, macroscopic dimension, spectral gaps and higher signatures*, Preprint (1996)
- [3] **J W Milnor**, *Topology from the differentiable viewpoint*, Based on notes by David W. Weaver, The University Press of Virginia, Charlottesville, Va. (1965) [MR0226651](#)
- [4] **J W Milnor, J D Stasheff**, *Characteristic classes*, Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ (1974) [MR0440554](#) Annals of Mathematics Studies, No. 76
- [5] **E H Spanier**, *Algebraic topology*, McGraw-Hill Book Co., New York (1966) [MR0210112](#)
- [6] **N E Steenrod**, *Cohomology operations*, Lectures by N. E. Steenrod written and revised by D. B. A. Epstein. Annals of Mathematics Studies, No. 50, Princeton University Press, Princeton, N.J. (1962) [MR0145525](#)
- [7] **H Whitney**, *Differentiable manifolds*, Ann. of Math. (2) 37 (1936) 645–680 [MR1503303](#)

*B Verkin Institute for Low Temperature Physics
Lenina ave 47, Kharkov 61103, Ukraine*

bolotov@univer.kharkov.ua

Received: 2 March 2006