Pacific Journal of Mathematics

COMPLETE AREA MINIMIZING MINIMAL SURFACES WHICH ARE NOT TOTALLY GEODESIC

JOEL HASS

Vol. 111, No. 1

November 1984

COMPLETE AREA MINIMIZING MINIMAL SURFACES WHICH ARE NOT TOTALLY GEODESIC

JOEL HASS

If a 3-manifold has non-negative Ricci curvature, then a complete area minimizing minimal surface in the 3-manifold is totally geodesic. The main theorem gives a method of constructing non-totally geodesic examples of such surfaces in certain manifolds which do not satisfy the Ricci curvature conditions. In particular, examples are described for hyperbolic space.

It has recently been shown by Fischer-Colbrie and Schoen, and independently by Do Carmo and Peng, that if F is a complete stable minimal surface in R^3 then F is a plane. Fischer-Colbrie and Schoen [FC-S] have obtained a similar result for 3-manifolds of non-negative Ricci curvature, showing that complete stable minimal surfaces in such manifolds are either totally geodesic planes or totally geodesic cylinders.

The corresponding result is false for general metrics on R^3 . Anderson has obtained examples of complete stable minimal surfaces in hyperbolic 3-space, using the techniques of geometric measure theory [A]. However Anderson's methods do not specify the topological type of these examples. The main theorem of this paper will enable the construction of complete stable minimal surfaces which are not totally geodesic in a wide range of 3-manifolds. In fact the surfaces constructed will be area minimizing on any compact subset, a much stronger condition than stability. In hyperbolic space, we will obtain stable, embedded minimal surfaces whose limit sets are the entire sphere at infinity. The theorem is also applied to construct complete stable, embedded minimal surfaces which are not toally geodesic in another of the geometries on R^3 , in which R^3 is metrically the product of hyperbolic 2-space and the reals. Finally two examples are given of non-totally geodesic area minimizing minimal surfaces in non-simply connected 3-manifolds.

We will work in the category of smooth manifolds and maps. An immersed surface is minimal if the first variation of area is zero on any compact subset of F. A minimal surface F is stable if the second variation of area is non-negative on any compact subset of F. A minimal surface F is area minimizing if any compact subsurface F_1 of F minimizes area in

the class of all surfaces in M homotopic to F_1 (rel ∂F). This in particular implies that the first non-zero derivative of area for any variation is positive, if it exists. A mapping of a compact surface $f: F \to M$ is called least area if it minimizes area in its homotopy class.

The first ingredient in the proof is a result of Freedman-Hass-Scott [F-H-S] saying that a compact cover of an area minimizing surface is also area minimizing.

LEMMA 1. Let M be a P^2 -irreducible 3-manifold which covers a compact Riemannian 3-manifold. Let $f: F \to M$ be a 2-sided map which induces an injection of the fundamental group. Let M_1 be a cover of M and let F_1 be a finite k-fold cover of F such that $f_1: F_1 \to M_1$ is a lift of f. Then f is least area if and only if f_1 is least area.

The next ingredient is a property of surfaces, called subgroup separability, which is proved for surface groups in [S].

LEMMA 2. Surface groups are subgroup separable.

This property is equivalent to a geometric condition, given in Lemma 1.4, of [S], which we state below.

LEMMA 3. Let Y be a Hausdorff topological space with a regular covering \tilde{Y} and covering group Γ . Then Γ is subgroup separable if and only if given a finitely generated subgroup G of Γ and a compact subset X of \tilde{Y}/G there is a finite cover Y_1 of Y such that the projection $\tilde{Y}/G \to Y$ factors through Y_1 and X projects injectively into Y_1 .

THEOREM 1. Let M be a P^2 -irreducible Riemannian 3-manifold which covers a compact Riemannian 3-manifold and which admits a least area, 2-sided, incompressible surface F that is not totally geodesic. Let \tilde{M} be a cover of M with the induced metric. Then \tilde{M} contains an area minimizing complete not totally geodesic minimal surface. Furthermore, any lift of F is such a surface.

Proof. Let $f: F \to M$ be a least area immersion which is not totally geodesic. Let \tilde{F} be the cover of F of smallest degree such that there exists a map $\tilde{f}: \tilde{F} \to \tilde{M}$ covering f. If \tilde{F} is a finite cover of F, then \tilde{f} is a least area immersion by Lemma 1, and therefore is area minimizing. If \tilde{F} is an infinite cover of F, suppose that it is not area minimizing. Then there is a compact subset K of \tilde{F} and a variation supported on K such that the

variation of area is negative. By Lemma 3, there exists a space F_1 such that \tilde{F} covers F_1 and F_1 is a finite cover of F, and such that the covering projection of \tilde{F} to F_1 is 1-1 on K. Let K_1 be the projection of K in F_1 .



By Lemma 1, $f_1 = f \circ p$ is a least area immersion. But K_1 supports a variation yielding a mapping homotopic to f_1 but having less area. This contradiction shows that \tilde{f} is indeed area minimizing.

REMARK. If we restrict to the case where \hat{M} is the universal cover of M then the weaker condition of residual finiteness of surface groups would suffice.

REMARK. The condition of P^2 -irreducibility is not necessary. If we take surfaces minimizing area in a class of surfaces having a given action on the fundamental group, rather than in a homotopy class, then a similar result holds.

We now look at some applications.

EXAMPLE 1. The first will take \tilde{M} to be hyperbolic 3-space. For M we take a compact hyperbolic 3-manifold which fibers over S^1 . Examples of these were constructed by Jorgenson [J]. For F we take a least area surface homotopic to a fiber. Such a surface exists and is embedded [F-H-S]. \tilde{F} can be taken to be any lift of F. Then \tilde{F} has the topological type of a plane, is embedded and is stable. Since $\pi_1(F)$ is a normal subgroup of $\pi_1(M)$ it follows that the two groups acting on hyperbolic 3-space as covering transformations have the same limit set on the sphere at infinity. But M is compact and so $\pi_1(M)$ has dense limit set on the sphere at infinity would be a single circle. Cannon and Thurston have recently shown that the limit set of \tilde{F} is a space filling curve.

EXAMPLE 2. For the next example consider $\tilde{M} = R^3$ with the metric obtained by taking the product of hyperbolic 2-space with the real line. Then \tilde{M} covers M, a trivial circle bundle over a hyperbolic surface S of

genus greater than one, with the product metric. We can find in M an embedded incompressible surface F_0 , of genus greater than one, not homotopic to $S \times pt$ or a cover of $S \times pt$. As above, we can then minimize in the homotopy class of F_0 to obtain an embedded least area surface F. Since F is not a torus or a cover of $S \times pt$ it must be tangent to $S \times p$ for some point p. If F, like $S \times p$, was totally geodesic, its image would then agree everywhere with that of $S \times p$, which would mean that F covers $S \times p$. Thus F satisfies the hypothesis of Theorem 1.

EXAMPLES 3 AND 4. For the final two examples we consider a pair of non-simply-connected spaces, each covering the M of the previous example. We take M_1 to be the product of the hyperbolic plane with S^1 and M_2 to be the product of S with the real line. In each case the arguments of the previous example apply to give area minimizing minimal surfaces which are not totally geodesic.

References

- [A] M. Anderson, Thesis, U. of California, Berkeley, 1981.
- [C-T] J. Cannon and W. Thurston, to appear.
- [D-P] M. DoCarmo and C. K. Peng, Stable complete minimal surfaces in R³ are planes, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., 1 (1979), 903–905.
- [F-H-S] M. Freedman, J. Hass and G. P. Scott, *Least area incompressible surfaces in* 3-manifolds, to appear in Inventiones Math.
- [J] T. Jorgenson, Compact 3-manifolds of constant negative curvature fibering over the circle, Ann. of Math., **106** (1977), 61–72.
- [FC-S] D. Fischer-Colbrie and R. Schoen, The structure of complete stable minimal surfaces in 3-manifolds of non-negative scalar curvature, C.P.A.M., 33 (1980), 199-211.
- [S] P. Scott, Subgoups of surface groups are almost geometric, J. London Math. Soc., (2), 17 (1978), 555–565.

Received October 5, 1982.

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN ANN ARBOR, MI 48109

PACIFIC JOURNAL OF MATHEMATICS

EDITORS

DONALD BABBITT (Managing Editor) University of California Los Angeles, CA 90024

HUGO ROSSI University of Utah Salt Lake City, UT 84112

C. C. MOORE and ARTHUR OGUS University of California Berkeley, CA 94720 J. DUGUNDJI Department of Mathematics University of Southern California Los Angeles, CA 90089-1113

R. FINN and H. SAMELSON Stanford University Stanford, CA 94305

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

R. Arens

E. F. BECKENBACH E (1906–1982)

B. H. NEUMANN I

F. WOLF K. YOSHIDA

SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONS

UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA MONTANA STATE UNIVERSITY UNIVERSITY OF NEVADA, RENO NEW MEXICO STATE UNIVERSITY OREGON STATE UNIVERSITY UNIVERSITY OF OREGON UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA STANFORD UNIVERSITY UNIVERSITY OF HAWAII UNIVERSITY OF TOKYO UNIVERSITY OF UTAH WASHINGTON STATE UNIVERSITY UNIVERSITY OF WASHINGTON

Pacific Journal of MathematicsVol. 111, No. 1November, 1984

Harald Brandenburg and Adam Stefan Mysior, For every Hausdorff space Y there exists a nontrivial Moore space on which all continuous functions into Y are constant 1 Henry Dappa, A Marcinkiewicz criterion for L ^p -multipliers 9 P. H. Doyle, III and John Gilbert Hocking, Bijectively related spaces. I. 3 Manifolds 23 Joel Hass, Complete area minimizing minimal surfaces which are not totally geodesic geodesic 35 Aarno Hohti, On Ginsburg-Isbell derivatives and ranks of metric spaces 39 Richard Howard Hudson, Diophantine determinations of $3^{(p-1)/8}$ and $5^{(p-1)/4}$ 49 A. F. Izé and A. Ventura, Asymptotic behavior of a perturbed neutral functional-differential equation related to the solution of the unperturbed linear system 57 Palle E. T. Jorgensen, Spectral representations of unbounded nonlinear operators on Hilbert space 93 Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with regular completions 105 Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" 117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds	
space Y there exists a nontrivial Moore space on which all continuous functions into Y are constant	Harald Brandenburg and Adam Stefan Mysior, For every Hausdorff
functions into Y are constant 1 Henry Dappa, A Marcinkiewicz criterion for L ^p -multipliers 9 P. H. Doyle, III and John Gilbert Hocking, Bijectively related spaces. I. 33 Manifolds 23 Joel Hass, Complete area minimizing minimal surfaces which are not totally geodesic 35 Aarno Hohti, On Ginsburg-Isbell derivatives and ranks of metric spaces 39 Richard Howard Hudson, Diophantine determinations of 3 ^{(p-1)/8} and 5 ^{(p-1)/4} 49 A. F. Izé and A. Ventura, Asymptotic behavior of a perturbed neutral functional-differential equation related to the solution of the unperturbed linear system 57 Palle E. T. Jorgensen, Spectral representations of unbounded nonlinear operators on Hilbert space 93 Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with regular completions 105 Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" 117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian atmost-product manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links <td< td=""><td>space Y there exists a nontrivial Moore space on which all continuous</td></td<>	space Y there exists a nontrivial Moore space on which all continuous
Henry Dappa, A Marcinkiewicz criterion for L ^p -multipliers 9 P. H. Doyle, III and John Gilbert Hocking, Bijectively related spaces. I. 23 Manifolds 23 Joel Hass, Complete area minimizing minimal surfaces which are not totally geodesic 35 Aarno Hohti, On Ginsburg-Isbell derivatives and ranks of metric spaces 39 Richard Howard Hudson, Diophantine determinations of 3 ^{(p-1)/8} and 5 ^{(p-1)/4} 49 A. F. Izé and A. Ventura, Asymptotic behavior of a perturbed neutral functional-differential equation related to the solution of the unperturbed linear system 57 Palle E. T. Jorgensen, Spectral representations of unbounded nonlinear operators on Hilbert space 93 Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with regular completions 105 Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" 117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnected ness 231	functions into Y are constant1
 P. H. Doyle, III and John Gilbert Hocking, Bijectively related spaces. I. Manifolds	Henry Dappa, A Marcinkiewicz criterion for L^p -multipliers
Manifolds 23 Joel Hass, Complete area minimizing minimal surfaces which are not totally geodesic 35 Aarno Hohti, On Ginsburg-Isbell derivatives and ranks of metric spaces 39 Richard Howard Hudson, Diophantine determinations of $3^{(p-1)/8}$ and $5^{(p-1)/4}$. 49 A. F. Izé and A. Ventura, Asymptotic behavior of a perturbed neutral functional-differential equation related to the solution of the unperturbed linear system 57 Palle E. T. Jorgensen, Spectral representations of unbounded nonlinear operators on Hilbert space 93 Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with regular completions 105 Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" 117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231	P. H. Doyle, III and John Gilbert Hocking, Bijectively related spaces. I.
Joel Hass, Complete area minimizing minimal surfaces which are not totally geodesic	Manifolds
geodesic 35 Aarno Hohti, On Ginsburg-Isbell derivatives and ranks of metric spaces 39 Richard Howard Hudson, Diophantine determinations of $3^{(p-1)/8}$ and $5^{(p-1)/4}$	Joel Hass, Complete area minimizing minimal surfaces which are not totally
Aarno Hohti, On Ginsburg-Isbell derivatives and ranks of metric spaces	geodesic
Richard Howard Hudson, Diophantine determinations of $3^{(p-1)/8}$ and $5^{(p-1)/4}$	Aarno Hohti, On Ginsburg-Isbell derivatives and ranks of metric spaces 39
5 ^{(p-1)/4}	Richard Howard Hudson, Diophantine determinations of $3^{(p-1)/8}$ and
A. F. Izé and A. Ventura, Asymptotic behavior of a perturbed neutral functional-differential equation related to the solution of the unperturbed linear system .57 Palle E. T. Jorgensen, Spectral representations of unbounded nonlinear operators on Hilbert space .93 Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with regular completions .05 Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" .117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative varieties and power varieties .125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex .137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds .163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators .179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links .209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness .231	$5^{(p-1)/4}$
functional-differential equation related to the solution of the unperturbed linear system	A. F. Izé and A. Ventura, Asymptotic behavior of a perturbed neutral
linear system 57 Palle E. T. Jorgensen, Spectral representations of unbounded nonlinear operators on Hilbert space 93 Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with regular completions 105 Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" 117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231	functional-differential equation related to the solution of the unperturbed
Palle E. T. Jorgensen, Spectral representations of unbounded nonlinear operators on Hilbert space 93 Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with regular completions 105 Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" 117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231	linear system
operators on Hilbert space	Palle E. T. Jorgensen, Spectral representations of unbounded nonlinear
Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with 105 Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" 117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential 163 Vorentel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star 179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231	operators on Hilbert space
regular completions105Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions"117Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative varieties and power varieties125Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex137Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds163Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators179Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links209Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness231William Victor Smith and Don Harrell Tusker, Wask interval204	Darrell Conley Kent and Gary Douglas Richardson, Cauchy spaces with
Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions" 117 Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative 125 Varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential 169 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star 179 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231 William Victor Smith and Don Harrell Tuckor, Wask interval 201	regular completions105
Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative 125 Varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology 137 groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential 163 operators 179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231 William Victor Smith and Don Harrell Tucker, Wask interval 201	Mark Mahowald, An addendum to: "bo-resolutions"
varieties and power varieties 125 Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 163 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231	Stuart Wayne Margolis and Jean-Eric Pin, Minimal noncommutative
Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology groups of the Koszul complex 137 Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 163 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231	varieties and power varieties
groups of the Koszul complex	Carla Massaza and Alfio Ragusa, Some conditions on the homology
Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231 William Victor Smith and Don Harrell Tuckor, Work integral	groups of the Koszul complex
manifolds 163 Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 163 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links 179 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231	Vicente Miquel Molina, Some examples of Riemannian almost-product
Roderic Murufas, Inverse spectral problems for certain differential operators 179 Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links 209 Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness 231 William Victor Smith and Don Harrell Tuckor, Wask integral	manifolds
operators	Roderic Murufas. Inverse spectral problems for certain differential
Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star links	operators
links	Ulrich Oertel, Closed incompressible surfaces in complements of star
Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness	links
William Victor Smith and Don Harroll Tucker, Weak integral	Katsuro Sakai, A characterization of local equiconnectedness
Winnann Victor Sinnth and Don Harren Tucker, Weak in Cera	William Victor Smith and Don Harrell Tucker, Weak integral
convergence theorems and operator measures	convergence theorems and operator measures