

# *Algebra & Number Theory*

Volume 13

2019

No. 9

**Lower bounds for the least prime in Chebotarev**

Andrew Fiori



# Lower bounds for the least prime in Chebotarev

Andrew Fiori

In this paper we show there exists an infinite family of number fields  $L$ , Galois over  $\mathbb{Q}$ , for which the smallest prime  $p$  of  $\mathbb{Q}$  which splits completely in  $L$  has size at least  $(\log(|D_L|))^{2+o(1)}$ . This gives a converse to various upper bounds, which shows that they are best possible.

## 1. Introduction

The purpose of this note is to prove the following result.

**Theorem 1.** *There exists an infinite family of number fields  $L$ , Galois over  $\mathbb{Q}$ , for which the smallest prime  $p$  of  $\mathbb{Q}$  which splits completely in  $L$  has size at least*

$$(1 + o(1)) \left( \frac{3e^\gamma}{2\pi} \right)^2 \left( \frac{\log(|D_L|) \log(2 \log \log(|D_L|))}{\log \log(|D_L|)} \right)^2$$

as the absolute discriminant  $D_L$  of  $L$  over  $\mathbb{Q}$ , tends to infinity.

The result is independent of the generalized Riemann hypothesis. The result complements the existing literature on what is essentially a converse problem, stated generally as:

**Problem.** Let  $K$  be a number field, and  $L$  be a Galois extension of  $K$ , for any conjugacy class  $\mathcal{C}$  in  $\Gamma(L/K)$ , the Galois group of  $L/K$ , show that the smallest (in norm) unramified degree one prime  $\mathfrak{p}$  of  $K$  for which the conjugacy class  $\text{Frob}_{\mathfrak{p}}$  is  $\mathcal{C}$  is *small* relative to  $|D_L|$ , the absolute discriminant of  $L/K$ .

Solutions to this problem have important applications in the explicit computation of class groups (see [Belabas et al. 2008]) where smaller is better. Some of the history of just how small we can get is summarized below:

- Lagarias and Odlyzko [1977] showed  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p}) < (\log(|D_L|))^{2+o(1)}$  conditionally on GRH.
- Bach and Sorenson [1996] gave an explicit constant  $C$  so that  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p}) < C(\log(|D_L|))^2$  conditionally on GRH.
- Lagarias, Montgomery, and Odlyzko [Lagarias et al. 1979] showed there is a constant  $A$  such that  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p}) < |D_L|^A$ .

---

The author thanks the University of Lethbridge for providing a stimulating environment to conduct this work and in particular Nathan Ng and Habiba Kadiri for directing him towards this project. The author would also like to thank the referee whose suggestions simplified the proof of our main result.

MSC2010: primary 11R44; secondary 11R29.

Keywords: Chebotarev, class groups.

- Zaman [2017] showed  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p}) < |D_L|^{40}$  for  $D_L$  sufficiently large.
- Kadiri, Ng and Wong [Kadiri et al. 2019] improved this to  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p}) < |D_L|^{16}$  for  $D_L$  sufficiently large.
- Ahn and Kwon [2019] showed  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p}) < |D_L|^{12577}$  for all  $L$ .

By the above, [Theorem 1](#) and the GRH bound above are best possible up to the exact  $o(1)$  term.

**Remark.** The family under consideration will be a subfamily of the Hilbert class fields of quadratic imaginary extensions of  $\mathbb{Q}$ . All of the Galois groups will be generalized dihedral groups, and in the family the degree of the extensions goes to infinity.

We also would like to point out the work of Sandari [2018, Section 1.3] where some similar features of this family are remarked on in a different context.

## 2. Proofs

We first recall a few basic facts from algebraic number theory and class field theory.

**Lemma 2.** *Let  $K = \mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-d})$  where  $d = |\text{disc}(K)|$ , let  $\mathfrak{p}$  be a principal prime ideal of  $K$ . If we have  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p}) = (p)$  then  $p$  is a norm of  $\mathcal{O}_K$  and hence  $p \geq \frac{d}{4}$ .*

*Proof.* Assuming  $\mathfrak{p}$  is principally generated by  $x$ , then  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p})$  is principally generated by  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(x)$ . As norms from  $K$  are positive, this gives that  $p$  must be a norm.

We next note that for  $x + y\sqrt{-d} \in \mathcal{O}_K$  the expression  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(x + y\sqrt{-d}) = x^2 + dy^2$  cannot be prime if  $y = 0$ . Now, because  $\mathcal{O}_K \subset \frac{1}{2}\mathbb{Z} + \frac{\sqrt{-d}}{2}\mathbb{Z}$  we conclude that if the norm is a prime, then  $y \geq \frac{1}{2}$ , from which it follows that if  $p$  is a norm then  $p \geq \frac{d}{4}$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 3.** *Let  $K = \mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-d})$  where  $d = |\text{disc}(K)|$ , suppose that  $H$  is the Hilbert class field of  $K$ . If  $p$  is a prime of  $\mathbb{Z}$  which splits completely in  $H$ , then  $p$  splits in  $K$  as  $(p) = \mathfrak{p}_1\mathfrak{p}_2$  where both  $\mathfrak{p}_1$  and  $\mathfrak{p}_2$  are principal and  $N_{K/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathfrak{p}_i) = (p)$ . In particular, by the previous lemma  $p \geq \frac{d}{4}$ .*

*Proof.* The first claim is clear because ramification degrees, inertia degrees and hence splitting degrees are multiplicative in towers. That  $\mathfrak{p}_i$  must be principal is a consequence of class field theory. Principal ideals for  $\mathcal{O}_K$  map to the trivial Galois element for the Galois group of the Hilbert class field. However, for unramified prime ideals this map gives Frobenius. As the Frobenius element is trivial precisely when the inertial degree is 1, equivalently for Galois fields when the prime splits completely, we conclude the result.  $\square$

**Remark 4.** Denote by  $\chi_d$  the quadratic Dirichlet character with fundamental discriminant  $-d$ . The main idea of the proof is to use the class number formula with lower bounds for  $L(1, \chi_d)$ . Using Siegel's ineffective bound gives

$$d = h_K^{2+o(1)} = \log |D_H|^{2+o(1)}.$$

To obtain our precise result we refine the  $o(1)$  term using extreme values of  $L(1, \chi_d)$ .

**Lemma 5.** *Let  $K = \mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-d})$  where  $d = |\text{disc}(K)| > 16$ , suppose that  $H$  is the Hilbert class field of  $K$ . Then*

$$\log |D_H| = h_K \log(d) = \frac{1}{\pi} L(1, \chi_d) \sqrt{d} \log(d)$$

where  $h_K$  is the class number of  $K$ ,  $D_H$  is the discriminant of  $H$  and  $\chi_d$  is the quadratic Dirichlet character with fundamental discriminant  $-d$ .

*Proof.* The first equality is immediate from the multiplicativity of the discriminant in towers, the second follows from the analytic class number formula

$$h_K = \frac{\sqrt{d}}{\pi} L(1, \chi_d). \quad \square$$

The estimates on the extreme values of  $L(1, \chi_d)$  which we need are the following.

**Theorem 6.** *There exists a family of quadratic imaginary fields  $K = \mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-d})$  where  $d = |\text{disc}(K)|$  such that for  $\chi_d$ , the quadratic Dirichlet character with fundamental discriminant  $-d$ , we have*

$$L(1, \chi_d) < (1 + o(1)) \frac{\pi^2}{6e^\gamma \log \log(d)}.$$

A result of this sort was originally proven by Littlewood [1928] conditional on the generalized Riemann hypothesis, his result was proven unconditionally by Paley [1932] the version stated here follows from the work of Chowla [1949]. It is possible that the work of Granville and Soundararajan [2003] can further refine the constants in the above, and consequently those in [Theorem 1](#).

The following proof includes several significant simplifications suggested by the referee. We would like to thank them for these valuable suggestions.

*Proof of Theorem 1.* We consider the family of fields  $L = H_K$  where  $K$  is a field from the infinite family of [Theorem 6](#) for which  $d > 16$ . To complete the proof we introduce some notation, define

$$x_d = L(1, \chi_d) \log \log(d) \quad \text{and} \quad f_d(x) = \frac{x \sqrt{d} \log(d)}{\pi \log \log(d)}.$$

Then by our choice of  $d$  we have

$$x_d < \frac{\pi^2}{6e^\gamma} + o(1)$$

and by [Lemma 5](#) we have

$$\log |D_L| = f_d(x_d).$$

Now because the function  $y \mapsto y \log(2 \log(y)) / \log(y)$  is increasing for  $y > e$  and as

$$f_d(x_d) = \log |D_L| = h_K \log(d) \geq \log(16) > e$$

it follows that

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\log|D_L| \log(2 \log \log|D_L|)}{\log \log|D_L|} &= \frac{f_d(x_d) \log(2 \log(f_d(x_d)))}{\log(f_d(x_d))} \\ &\leq \frac{f_d\left(\frac{\pi^2}{6e^\gamma} + o(1)\right) \log\left(2 \log\left(f_d\left(\frac{\pi^2}{6e^\gamma} + o(1)\right)\right)\right)}{\log\left(f_d\left(\frac{\pi^2}{6e^\gamma} + o(1)\right)\right)} \\ &\leq (1 + o(1)) \frac{\pi}{3e^\gamma} \sqrt{d}. \end{aligned}$$

Combining the above with the bounds  $p \geq \frac{d}{4}$  from [Lemma 3](#) we obtain the result.  $\square$

### 3. Numerics

[Table 1](#) illustrates the phenomenon by giving the ratio

$$\text{Ratio} = p / \left( \frac{3e^\gamma}{2\pi} \right)^2 \left( \frac{\log(|D_L|) \log(2 \log \log(|D_L|))}{\log \log(|D_L|)} \right)^2$$

for an example of a the Hilbert class field of a quadratic imaginary field of each class number less than 100 with large discriminant.

Note that in [Table 1](#) we have  $K = \mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-d})$  and  $|D_L| = d^{h_K}$ .

### References

- [Ahn and Kwon 2019] J.-H. Ahn and S.-H. Kwon, “An explicit upper bound for the least prime ideal in the Chebotarev density theorem”, *Ann. Inst. Fourier (Grenoble)* **69**:3 (2019), 1411–1458. [Zbl](#)
- [Bach and Sorenson 1996] E. Bach and J. Sorenson, “Explicit bounds for primes in residue classes”, *Math. Comp.* **65**:216 (1996), 1717–1735. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Belabas et al. 2008] K. Belabas, F. Diaz y Diaz, and E. Friedman, “Small generators of the ideal class group”, *Math. Comp.* **77**:262 (2008), 1185–1197. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Chowla 1949] S. Chowla, “Improvement of a theorem of Linnik and Walfisz”, *Proc. London Math. Soc. (2)* **50** (1949), 423–429. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Granville and Soundararajan 2003] A. Granville and K. Soundararajan, “The distribution of values of  $L(1, \chi_d)$ ”, *Geom. Funct. Anal.* **13**:5 (2003), 992–1028. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Kadiri et al. 2019] H. Kadiri, N. Ng, and P.-J. Wong, “The least prime ideal in the Chebotarev density theorem”, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **147**:6 (2019), 2289–2303. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Lagarias and Odlyzko 1977] J. C. Lagarias and A. M. Odlyzko, “Effective versions of the Chebotarev density theorem”, pp. 409–464 in *Algebraic number fields: L-functions and Galois properties* (Durham, UK, 1975), edited by A. Fröhlich, Academic Press, London, 1977. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Lagarias et al. 1979] J. C. Lagarias, H. L. Montgomery, and A. M. Odlyzko, “A bound for the least prime ideal in the Chebotarev density theorem”, *Invent. Math.* **54**:3 (1979), 271–296. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Littlewood 1928] J. E. Littlewood, “On the class-number of the corpus  $P(\sqrt{-k})$ ”, *Proc. London Math. Soc. (2)* **27**:1 (1928), 358–372. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Paley 1932] R. E. A. C. Paley, “A theorem on characters”, *J. London Math. Soc.* **7**:1 (1932), 28–32. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)
- [Sardari 2018] N. T. Sardari, “The least prime number represented by a binary quadratic form”, preprint, 2018. [arXiv](#)
- [Zaman 2017] A. Zaman, “Bounding the least prime ideal in the Chebotarev density theorem”, *Funct. Approx. Comment. Math.* **57**:1 (2017), 115–142. [MR](#) [Zbl](#)

$h_K$	$d$	$p$	Ratio	$h_K$	$d$	$p$	Ratio	$h_K$	$d$	$p$	Ratio
1	163	41	4.1557	34	189883	47491	2.2528	67	652723	163181	1.9030
2	427	107	2.4287	35	210907	52727	2.3373	68	819163	204791	2.2546
3	907	227	2.1188	36	217627	54409	2.2819	69	888427	222107	2.3556
4	1555	389	1.9476	37	158923	39733	1.6620	70	811507	202877	2.1215
5	2683	673	2.0276	38	289963	72493	2.6454	71	909547	227387	2.2823
6	3763	941	1.9222	39	253507	63377	2.2500	72	947923	236981	2.3061
7	5923	1481	2.1071	40	260947	65239	2.2034	73	886867	221717	2.1227
8	6307	1579	1.7569	41	296587	74149	2.3513	74	951043	237763	2.2001
9	10627	2657	2.1729	42	280267	70067	2.1445	75	916507	229127	2.0792
10	13843	3461	2.2386	43	300787	75209	2.1838	76	1086187	271549	2.3521
11	15667	3917	2.0939	44	319867	79967	2.2079	77	1242763	310693	2.5821
12	17803	4451	1.9938	45	308323	77081	2.0542	78	1004347	251087	2.0958
13	20563	5147	1.9503	46	462883	115727	2.7990	79	1333963	333491	2.6208
14	30067	7517	2.3373	47	375523	93887	2.2489	80	1165483	291371	2.2775
15	34483	8623	2.3173	48	335203	83813	1.9638	81	1030723	257687	2.0011
16	31243	7817	1.9050	49	393187	98297	2.1693	82	1446547	361637	2.6277
17	37123	9281	1.9719	50	389467	97367	2.0743	83	1074907	268729	1.9851
18	48427	12107	2.2225	51	546067	136519	2.6772	84	1225387	306347	2.1765
19	38707	9677	1.6747	52	439147	109789	2.1422	85	1285747	321443	2.2210
20	58507	14627	2.1572	53	425107	106277	2.0124	86	1534723	383681	2.5366
21	61483	15373	2.0614	54	532123	133033	2.3604	87	1261747	315437	2.0941
22	85507	21377	2.5024	55	452083	113021	1.9839	88	1265587	316403	2.0564
23	90787	22697	2.4308	56	494323	123581	2.0737	89	1429387	357347	2.2395
24	111763	27941	2.6847	57	615883	153991	2.4279	90	1548523	387137	2.3529
25	93307	23327	2.1425	58	586987	146749	2.2565	91	1391083	347771	2.1002
26	103027	25759	2.1714	59	474307	118583	1.8204	92	1452067	363017	2.1371
27	103387	25847	2.0351	60	662803	165701	2.3566	93	1475203	368801	2.1244
28	126043	31511	2.2543	61	606643	151667	2.1185	94	1587763	396943	2.2212
29	166147	41539	2.6760	62	647707	161947	2.1768	95	1659067	414767	2.2638
30	134467	33617	2.1037	63	991027	247759	3.0559	96	1684027	421009	2.2501
31	133387	33347	1.9698	64	693067	173267	2.1783	97	1842523	460633	2.3882
32	164803	41201	2.2263	65	703123	175781	2.1443	98	2383747	595939	2.9359
33	222643	55661	2.7216	66	958483	239623	2.7278	99	1480627	370159	1.9012

**Table 1.** Examples of smallest split primes in Hilbert class fields of  $\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-d})$ .

Communicated by Andrew Granville

Received 2019-03-01

Revised 2019-05-08

Accepted 2019-06-27

[andrew.fiori@uleth.ca](mailto:andrew.fiori@uleth.ca)

*Department of Mathematics and Computer Science, University of Lethbridge,  
AB, Canada*

# Algebra & Number Theory

[msp.org/ant](http://msp.org/ant)

## EDITORS

### MANAGING EDITOR

Bjorn Poonen  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Cambridge, USA

### EDITORIAL BOARD CHAIR

David Eisenbud  
University of California  
Berkeley, USA

### BOARD OF EDITORS

Richard E. Borcherds	University of California, Berkeley, USA	Martin Olsson	University of California, Berkeley, USA
Antoine Chambert-Loir	Université Paris-Diderot, France	Raman Parimala	Emory University, USA
J-L. Colliot-Thélène	CNRS, Université Paris-Sud, France	Jonathan Pila	University of Oxford, UK
Brian D. Conrad	Stanford University, USA	Anand Pillay	University of Notre Dame, USA
Samit Dasgupta	University of California, Santa Cruz, USA	Michael Rapoport	Universität Bonn, Germany
Hélène Esnault	Freie Universität Berlin, Germany	Victor Reiner	University of Minnesota, USA
Gavril Farkas	Humboldt Universität zu Berlin, Germany	Peter Sarnak	Princeton University, USA
Hubert Flenner	Ruhr-Universität, Germany	Joseph H. Silverman	Brown University, USA
Sergey Fomin	University of Michigan, USA	Michael Singer	North Carolina State University, USA
Edward Frenkel	University of California, Berkeley, USA	Christopher Skinner	Princeton University, USA
Wee Teck Gan	National University of Singapore	Vasudevan Srinivas	Tata Inst. of Fund. Research, India
Andrew Granville	Université de Montréal, Canada	J. Toby Stafford	University of Michigan, USA
Ben J. Green	University of Oxford, UK	Pham Huu Tiep	University of Arizona, USA
Joseph Gubeladze	San Francisco State University, USA	Ravi Vakil	Stanford University, USA
Roger Heath-Brown	Oxford University, UK	Michel van den Bergh	Hasselt University, Belgium
Craig Huneke	University of Virginia, USA	Akshay Venkatesh	Institute for Advanced Study, USA
Kiran S. Kedlaya	Univ. of California, San Diego, USA	Marie-France Vignéras	Université Paris VII, France
János Kollár	Princeton University, USA	Kei-Ichi Watanabe	Nihon University, Japan
Philippe Michel	École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne	Melanie Matchett Wood	University of Wisconsin, Madison, USA
Susan Montgomery	University of Southern California, USA	Shou-Wu Zhang	Princeton University, USA
Shigefumi Mori	RIMS, Kyoto University, Japan		

## PRODUCTION

[production@msp.org](mailto:production@msp.org)

Silvio Levy, Scientific Editor

---

See inside back cover or [msp.org/ant](http://msp.org/ant) for submission instructions.


The subscription price for 2019 is US \$385/year for the electronic version, and \$590/year (+\$60, if shipping outside the US) for print and electronic. Subscriptions, requests for back issues and changes of subscriber address should be sent to MSP.

Algebra & Number Theory (ISSN 1944-7833 electronic, 1937-0652 printed) at Mathematical Sciences Publishers, 798 Evans Hall #3840, c/o University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720-3840 is published continuously online. Periodical rate postage paid at Berkeley, CA 94704, and additional mailing offices.

---

ANT peer review and production are managed by EditFLOW® from MSP.

PUBLISHED BY

 **mathematical sciences publishers**  
nonprofit scientific publishing

<http://msp.org/>

© 2019 Mathematical Sciences Publishers



# Algebra & Number Theory

Volume 13    No. 9    2019

---

<a href="#">Proof of a conjecture of Colliot-Thélène and a diophantine excision theorem</a>	1983
JAN DENEFF	
<a href="#">Irreducible characters with bounded root Artin conductor</a>	1997
AMALIA PIZARRO-MADARIAGA	
<a href="#">Frobenius–Perron theory of endofunctors</a>	2005
JIANMIN CHEN, ZHIBIN GAO, ELIZABETH WICKS, JAMES J. ZHANG, XIAOHONG ZHANG and HONG ZHU	
<a href="#">Positivity of anticanonical divisors and <math>F</math>-purity of fibers</a>	2057
SHO EJIRI	
<a href="#">A probabilistic approach to systems of parameters and Noether normalization</a>	2081
JULIETTE BRUCE and DANIEL ERMAN	
<a href="#">The structure of correlations of multiplicative functions at almost all scales, with applications to the Chowla and Elliott conjectures</a>	2103
TERENCE TAO and JONI TERÄVÄINEN	
<a href="#">VI-modules in nondescribing characteristic, part I</a>	2151
ROHIT NAGPAL	
<a href="#">Degree of irrationality of very general abelian surfaces</a>	2191
NATHAN CHEN	
<a href="#">Lower bounds for the least prime in Chebotarev</a>	2199
ANDREW FIORI	
<a href="#">Brody hyperbolicity of base spaces of certain families of varieties</a>	2205
MIHNEA POPA, BEHROUZ TAJI and LEI WU	