

*Pacific  
Journal of  
Mathematics*

STANDARD GRAPHS IN LENS SPACES

YING-QING WU

Volume 220 No. 2

June 2005



## STANDARD GRAPHS IN LENS SPACES

YING-QING WU

**We prove the conjecture of Menasco and Zhang that a completely tubing compressible tangle consists of at most two families of parallel strands. This conjecture is related to problems concerning graphs in 3-manifolds, and follows from a theorem that states that a 1-vertex graph in  $M$  is standard, in a certain sense, if and only if the exteriors of all its nontrivial subgraphs are handlebodies.**

### 1. Introduction

In this paper, a tangle is a pair  $(W, t)$ , where  $W$  is a compact orientable 3-manifold such that  $\partial W$  is a sphere, and  $t = \alpha_1 \cup \cdots \cup \alpha_n$  is a set of mutually disjoint, properly embedded arcs in  $W$ , called the *strands*. Denote by  $N(t)$  a regular neighborhood of  $t$ , and by  $\eta(t) = \text{Int } N(t)$  an open neighborhood of  $t$ . Let  $X = X(t)$  be the tangle space  $W - \eta(t)$ , and let  $P$  be the planar surface  $\partial W \cap X = \partial W - \eta(\partial t)$ . Denote by  $A_i$  the annulus  $\partial N(\alpha_i) \cap X$ . Thus  $\partial X = P \cup (\bigcup A_i)$ . The  $A_i$ -tubing of  $P$  is the surface  $F_i = P \cup A_i$ . Following Gordon [1987], we say that a set of curves  $\{c_1, \dots, c_k\}$  on the boundary of a handlebody  $H$  is *primitive* if there exist disjoint disks  $D_1, \dots, D_k$  in  $H$  such that  $\partial D_i$  intersects  $\bigcup c_j$  transversely at a single point lying on  $c_i$ . A set of annuli is primitive if their core curves form a primitive set. The surface  $P$  is  $A_i$ -tubing compressible if  $F_i$  is compressible, and it is *completely  $A_i$ -tubing compressible* if  $F_i$  can be compressed until it becomes a set of annuli parallel to  $\bigcup_{j \neq i} A_j$ . Equivalently,  $P$  is completely  $A_i$ -tubing compressible if  $X$  is a handlebody, and the set of annuli  $\bigcup_{j \neq i} A_j$  is primitive on  $\partial X$ .

A tangle  $(W, t)$  is *completely tubing compressible* if the surface  $P$  above is completely  $A_i$ -tubing compressible for all  $i$ . Such tangles arise naturally in the study of reducible surgery on knots. For example, it follows from the proof of [Culler et al. 1987, Propositions 2.2.1 and 2.3.1] that if some surgery on a hyperbolic knot  $K$  produces a nonprime manifold  $M$ , then either the knot complement contains a closed essential surface, or there is a reducing sphere  $S$  cutting  $(M, K')$  into two

---

MSC2000: 57N10.

Keywords: lens spaces, graphs, handlebodies.

Partially supported by NSF grant DMS 9802558.

non-split completely tubing compressible tangles, where  $K'$  is the core of the Dehn filling solid torus.

Define a *band* in  $W$  to be an embedded disk  $D$  in  $W$  such that  $D \cap \partial W$  consists of two arcs on  $\partial D$ . A subcollection of strands  $t' = \{\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_k\}$  of  $t$  is *parallel* if there is a band  $D$  such that  $D \cap t = t'$ .

Define a *core arc* to be an arc  $\alpha$  in  $W$  such that  $W - \eta(\alpha)$  is a solid torus. Because of the uniqueness of the Heegaard splittings of  $S^3$ ,  $S^2 \times S^1$  and lens spaces, it is easy to see that  $W$  has at most two core arcs up to isotopy, and one if  $W$  is a punctured  $S^3$ ,  $S^2 \times I$  or  $L(p, 1)$ . However, a set of core arcs may contain arbitrarily many parallel families. This is the same phenomenon as links in  $S^3$ : A link  $L$  with  $n$  components may have the property that all of its components are trivial knots (so the components are isotopic to each other in  $S^3$ ), but the components of  $L$  are mutually non-parallel in the sense that they do not bound an annulus with interior disjoint from the link. The following theorem proves a conjecture of Menasco and Zhang [2001, Conjecture 5], which shows that this phenomenon will not happen if  $(W, t)$  is a completely tubing compressible tangle.

**Theorem 1.1.** *If  $(W, t)$  is a completely tubing compressible tangle, then  $t$  consists of at most two families of parallel core arcs.*

The problem is related to graphs in 3-manifolds. Let  $M = \widehat{W}$  be the union of  $W$  with a 3-ball  $B$ , and let  $\Gamma = \widehat{t}$  be the union of  $t$  with the straight arcs in  $B$  connecting  $\partial t$  to the central point  $v$  of  $B$ . Thus we have a graph  $\widehat{t}$  in the closed 3-manifold  $\widehat{W}$  with one vertex  $v$  and  $n$  edges  $e_1, \dots, e_n$  corresponding to the arcs  $\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_n$  of  $t$ . A graph  $\Gamma$  is *nontrivial* if it contains at least one edge. The *exterior* of a graph  $\Gamma$  in a 3-manifold  $M$  is  $E(\Gamma) = M - \eta(\Gamma)$ . It will be shown (see Lemma 2.6 below) that the tangle  $(W, t)$  is completely tubing compressible if and only if the exterior of any nontrivial subgraph of  $\widehat{t}$  in  $\widehat{W}$  is a handlebody. Thus the classification problem for completely tubing compressible tangles is equivalent to the classification problem for 1-vertex graphs  $\Gamma$  in a 3-manifold  $M$  which have the property that the exteriors of all its nontrivial subgraphs are handlebodies.

Since the exterior of a regular neighborhood of an edge of  $\Gamma$  is a solid torus,  $M$  has a Heegaard splitting of genus 1, hence it must be  $S^3$ ,  $S^2 \times S^1$ , or a lens space  $L(p, q)$ . Since  $L(p, q) \cong L(p, -q) \cong L(p, p-q)$  up to (possibly orientation reversing) homeomorphism, we may always assume that  $1 \leq q \leq p/2$ . When  $M$  is  $S^3$ , it follows from [Gordon 1987, Theorem 1] that the complement of any subgraph of  $\Gamma$  is a handlebody if and only if  $\Gamma$  is planar, that is, it is contained in a disk in  $S^3$ . Scharlemann and Thompson [1991] generalize this to all abstractly planar graphs in  $S^3$ . See also [Wu 1992b] for an alternative proof. For the general case, we need the following definitions.

A  $v$ -disk  $D$  in  $M$  is the image of a map  $f : D^2 \rightarrow M$  such that  $f$  is an embedding except that it identifies two boundary points of  $D^2$  to a point  $v$  in  $M$ . The boundary of  $D$  is  $\partial D = f(\partial D^2)$ . A  $v$ -disk  $D$  in a solid torus  $V$  is *standard* if  $D \cap \partial V = v$ , and  $D$  is isotopic (rel  $v$ ) to a  $v$ -disk  $D'$  on  $\partial V$ , which is longitudinal in the sense that there is a meridional disk  $\Delta$  of  $V$  such that  $D' \cap \Delta$  is a nonseparating arc on  $D'$ . We remark that it is important to require that the above isotopy be relative to  $v$  as it guarantees that the exterior of  $D$  is a handlebody.

A graph with a single vertex is called a *1-vertex graph*. Such a graph is connected, and all of its edges are loops. A 1-vertex graph  $\Gamma = e_1 \cup \dots \cup e_k$  in  $V$  with vertex  $v$  is *in standard position* if it is contained in a standard  $v$ -disk  $D$  in  $V$ . In this case we also say that the edges of  $\Gamma$  are parallel.

Let  $V_1 \cup V_2$  be a genus-one Heegaard splitting of a closed 3-manifold  $M$ . Then a 1-vertex graph  $\Gamma$  in  $M$  is *in standard position* (relative to the Heegaard splitting) if either

- (i)  $M$  is homeomorphic to  $S^3$ ,  $S^2 \times S^1$  or  $L(p, 1)$ , and  $\Gamma$  is contained in a single standard  $v$ -disk in  $V_1$  or  $V_2$ , or
- (ii)  $M$  is homeomorphic to  $L(p, q)$  with  $2 \leq q < p/2$ , and  $\Gamma$  is contained in two standard  $v$ -disks, one in each  $V_i$ .

A 1-vertex graph  $\Gamma$  in  $M$  is *standard* if it is isotopic to a graph in standard position. Since genus-one Heegaard splittings of 3-manifolds are unique up to isotopy [Waldhausen 1968; Bonahon and Otal 1982; Schultens 1993], this is independent of the choice of  $(V_1, V_2)$ . The following theorem characterizes standard graphs in 3-manifolds.

**Theorem 1.2.** *A nontrivial 1-vertex graph  $\Gamma$  in a closed orientable 3-manifold  $M$  is standard if and only if the exterior of any nontrivial subgraph of  $\Gamma$  is a handlebody.*

Note that the 3-manifold  $M$  in this theorem must be  $S^3$ ,  $S^2 \times S^1$ , or a lens space. For if  $\Gamma$  is standard then by definition  $M$  has a genus-one Heegaard splitting. On the other hand, if the exterior of any nontrivial subgraph of  $\Gamma$  is a handlebody, then in particular the exterior of an edge of  $\Gamma$  is a solid torus, so again  $M$  has a genus-one Heegaard splitting.

## 2. Proof of the Theorems

The following lemma proves the easy direction of Theorem 1.2.

**Lemma 2.1.** *If a 1-vertex graph  $\Gamma$  in a 3-manifold  $M$  is standard, then the exterior of any nontrivial subgraph  $\Gamma'$  of  $\Gamma$  is a handlebody.*

*Proof.* Clearly a subgraph of  $\Gamma$  is still standard, hence we need only prove the lemma for  $\Gamma' = \Gamma$ . Let  $(V_1, V_2)$  be a genus-one Heegaard splitting of  $M$ , and

assume that  $\Gamma$  is contained in the union of  $D_1 \cup D_2$ , where  $D_i$  is a standard  $v$ -disk in  $V_i$ . (The case that  $\Gamma$  is contained in a single standard  $v$ -disk is similar and simpler.) Put  $\Gamma_1 = \Gamma \cap D_1 = e_1 \cup \cdots \cup e_{r-1}$  and  $\Gamma_2 = \Gamma \cap D_2 = e_r \cup \cdots \cup e_n$ .

From the definition, one can see that the manifold  $V_i - \eta(D_i)$  is a product  $F_i \times I$ , where  $F_i$  is a once punctured torus. Therefore  $X = M - \eta(D_1 \cup D_2)$  is still a product of  $I$  and a once punctured torus, which is a handlebody. One can choose a regular neighborhood  $N(\Gamma)$  of  $\Gamma$  in  $M$  so that it is contained in  $N(D_1 \cup D_2)$ , and that the closure of each component of  $N(D_1 \cup D_2) - N(\Gamma)$  is a 3-ball  $H_i$  intersecting  $\partial N(D_1 \cup D_2)$  at two disks. Now  $M - \eta(\Gamma)$  is the union of  $X$  and the  $H_i$ . Since each  $H_i$  can be considered as a 1-handle attached to  $X$ , it follows that  $M - \eta(\Gamma)$  is a handlebody.  $\square$

The following lemma proves the other direction of Theorem 1.2 under a further assumption which, by [Menasco and Zhang 2001, Lemma 1], implies that  $M = S^3$  or  $S^2 \times S^1$ .

**Lemma 2.2.** *Let  $\Gamma$  be a 1-vertex graph in a closed orientable 3-manifold such that the exterior of any nontrivial subgraph of  $\Gamma$  is a handlebody. Let  $W = M - \eta(v)$ , and  $X = M - \eta(\Gamma)$ . If  $P = \partial W \cap X$  is compressible, then  $\Gamma$  is standard.*

*Proof.* Let  $D$  be a compressing disk of  $P$ . First assume that  $D$  is separating in  $W$ , cutting  $W$  into  $W_1$  and  $W_2$ . Let  $\Gamma_i$  be the subgraph of  $\Gamma$  consisting of edges whose intersection with  $W$  is contained in  $W_i$ . Each  $\Gamma_i$  is nontrivial as otherwise  $\partial D$  would be trivial on  $P$ , contradicting the hypothesis that it is a compressing disk. Now  $W_i$  is contained in the exterior of  $\Gamma_j$  (for  $j \neq i$ ) which is a handlebody by assumption. Since  $\partial W_i = S^2$  and handlebodies are irreducible, it follows that the  $W_i$  are 3-balls, hence  $W$  is also a 3-ball, and so  $M = S^3$ . In this case, by [Gordon 1987, Theorem 1] or [Scharlemann and Thompson 1991], the graph  $\Gamma$  is planar in  $S^3$ , which is easily seen to be equivalent to the condition that it is standard.

Now assume the  $D$  is non-separating in  $W$ . In this case  $W$  cannot be a 3-ball or punctured lens space, so it must be a punctured  $S^2 \times S^1$ , and so  $D$  cuts  $W$  into  $W' = S^2 \times I$ . The manifold  $X' = W' - \eta(t)$  is obtained from  $X$  by cutting along a nonseparating disk  $D$ , so it is a handlebody of genus  $n - 1$ , and attaching 2-handles to any proper subset of  $\bigcup A_i$  yields a handlebody. By [Gordon 1987, Theorem 2], the set  $\bigcup A_i$  is standard on  $\partial X'$ , which implies that there is a band  $D' = C \times I$  in  $W' = S^2 \times I$  containing  $t = \Gamma \cap W$ . It is clear that such a band  $D$  extends to a standard  $v$ -disk  $D''$  in  $M = S^2 \times S^1$  containing  $\Gamma$ .  $\square$

A *trivial arc* in a solid torus  $V$  is one which is isotopic rel  $\partial$  to an arc on  $\partial V$ . Let  $\gamma$  be a  $(p, q)$ -curve on  $T = \partial V$ . A properly embedded arc  $\alpha$  in  $V$  is  $\gamma$ -trivial if it lies on a meridian disk  $D$  of  $V$  such that  $\partial D$  intersects  $\gamma$  at  $p$  points. One can show that  $\alpha$  is  $\gamma$ -trivial if and only if it is isotopic to an arc  $\alpha'$  on  $T$  which always intersects  $\gamma$  in the same direction. When  $\alpha$  is  $\gamma$ -trivial, the *jumping number* of  $\alpha$

with respect to  $\gamma$ , denoted by  $u = u(\alpha, \gamma)$ , is defined to be the smallest intersection number between  $\alpha'$  and  $\gamma$  for  $\alpha' \subset T$  isotopic to  $\alpha$ . It should be noticed that not all trivial arcs in  $V$  are  $\gamma$ -trivial. Put  $X = V - \text{Int } N(\alpha)$ , and denote by  $X[\gamma]$  the manifold obtained by attaching a 2-handle to  $X$  along  $\gamma$ . The following theorem is essentially [Wu 2004, Theorem 2.2], and characterizes trivial arcs  $\alpha$  in  $V$  such that  $X[\gamma]$  is a solid torus.

**Lemma 2.3.** *Let  $\alpha$  be a trivial arc in a solid torus  $V$ , let  $\gamma$  be a  $(p, q)$ -curve on  $T = \partial V$  disjoint from  $\alpha$ , where  $0 < q \leq p/2$ , and let  $X = V - \text{Int } N(\alpha)$ . Then  $X[\gamma]$  is a solid torus if and only if  $\alpha$  is  $\gamma$ -trivial and the jumping number  $u(\alpha, \gamma)$  is equal to 1 or  $q$ .  $\square$*

**Lemma 2.4.** *Theorem 1.2 is holds if  $M = L(p, q)$  and  $\Gamma$  has at most two edges.*

*Proof.* If  $\Gamma$  has only one edge  $e_1$ , then  $V_1 = N(e_1)$  and  $V_2 = M - \text{Int } V_1$  form a genus-one Heegaard splitting of  $L(p, q)$ . We may isotope  $e_1$  to standard position in  $V_1$ , and the result follows.

We now assume that  $\Gamma = e_1 \cup e_2$ . Let  $V_1 = N(e_1)$ , and  $V_2 = M - \text{Int } V_1$ , which by assumption is a solid torus. Since  $e_2$  intersects  $e_1$  at the vertex  $v$  of  $\Gamma$ , we may assume that  $e_2 \cap V_1$  is an unknotted arc lying on a meridional disk  $D'$  of  $V_1$ . Let  $D$  be another meridional disk of  $V_1$  disjoint from  $D'$ , and let  $\gamma$  be the curve  $\partial D$  on  $T = \partial V_1$ . Since  $M$  is a lens space  $L(p, q)$ , it follows that  $\gamma$  is a  $(p, q)$  curve on  $T$  with respect to some longitude-meridian pair of  $V_2$ . Let  $\alpha$  be the embedded arc  $e_2 \cap V_2$  in  $V_2$ . Then the boundary of  $\alpha$  lies on the curve  $\gamma' = \partial D'$ , which is a parallel copy of  $\gamma$ .

Note that  $V_2 - \eta(\alpha) = M - \eta(\Gamma)$ , so by assumption it is a handlebody, which we denote  $H$ . The frontier  $N(\alpha) \cap H$  of  $N(\alpha)$  is an annulus  $A$  which must be primitive on  $H$ , because attaching the 2-handle  $N(\alpha)$  to  $H$  along  $A$  forms the solid torus  $V_2$ . Hence the core curve  $\alpha$  of the attached 2-handle  $N(\alpha)$  is a trivial arc in  $V_2$ .

Let  $\beta$  be an arc on  $\gamma'$  connecting the two endpoints of  $\alpha$ . Then  $\beta$  is isotopic to the arc  $e_2 \cap V_1$  on the disk  $D'$ , hence the curve  $\alpha \cup \beta$  is isotopic to  $e_2$ , which by assumption has exterior a solid torus in  $L(p, q)$ . Therefore, by Lemma 2.3,  $\alpha$  is  $\gamma$ -trivial, and the jumping number  $j(\alpha, \gamma)$  is either 1 or  $q$ . By definition  $\alpha$  is isotopic rel  $\partial$  to an arc  $\alpha'$  on  $T$  intersecting  $\gamma$  transversely at  $j(\alpha, \gamma)$  points in the same direction.

First suppose that  $j(\alpha, \gamma) = 1$ . Then  $e'_2 = \alpha' \cup \beta$  is a simple closed curve on  $T$  intersecting the meridian curve  $\gamma$  of  $V_1$  transversely at a single point, and is hence a longitude of  $V_1$ . Since  $\beta$  lies on  $\partial D'$  and  $e_2 \cap V_1$  is an arc on  $D'$ , there is an isotopy of  $\Gamma \cap V_1$  in  $V_1$  deforming  $e_2 \cap V_1$  to the arc  $\beta$ , and  $e_1$  to a loop  $e'_1$  in standard position in  $V_1$ . The isotopy deforms  $\Gamma$  to the graph  $\Gamma' = e'_1 \cup e'_2$ , with a single vertex  $v'$  on  $T$ . Since  $e'_2$  is a longitude on  $\partial V_1$  and  $e'_1$  is in standard position,

$e'_1 \cup e'_2$  bounds a  $v'$ -disk  $\Delta$  in  $V_1$ . Pushing  $\Delta - v'$  to the interior of  $V_1$  deforms  $\Gamma'$  to a graph in standard position, and hence the result follows.

Now suppose that  $j(\alpha, \gamma) = q > 1$ . Choose a meridional disk  $D_2$  of  $V_2$  containing  $\alpha'$  and intersecting  $\gamma$  at  $p$  points. Since  $\gamma'$  is a  $(p, q)$  curve, and the jumping number of  $\alpha$  is  $q$ , we can choose the arc  $\beta$  on  $\gamma'$  with  $\partial\beta = \partial\alpha$  so that the interior of  $\beta$  is disjoint from  $\partial D_2$ , hence  $e''_2 = \alpha' \cup \beta$  is a longitude of  $V_2$ . By an isotopy of  $\Gamma \cap V_1$  we can deform  $e_2 \cap V_1$  to  $\beta$ , and  $e_1$  to a loop  $e'_1$  in standard position in  $V_1$ . Let  $v' = e'_1 \cap e''_2$ . Then we can isotope  $e'_2$  rel  $v'$  to an edge  $e'_2$  in  $V_2$ , which by definition is in standard position in  $V_2$  because  $e''_2$  is a longitude of  $V_2$ . It follows that  $\Gamma$  is isotopic to the graph  $\Gamma' = e'_1 \cup e'_2$  in standard position, hence  $\Gamma$  is standard.  $\square$

Suppose  $F$  is a surface on the boundary of a 3-manifold  $X$ , and  $c$  is a simple closed curve in  $F$ . Denote by  $X_c$  the manifold obtained from  $X$  by attaching a 2-handle to  $X$  along  $c$ , and by  $F_c$  the corresponding surface in  $X_c$ . More explicitly,  $X_c = X \cup_\varphi (D^2 \times I)$  where  $\varphi$  identifies  $\partial D^2 \times I$  to a regular neighborhood  $A$  of  $c$  in  $F$ , and  $F_c = (F - A) \cup (D^2 \times \partial I)$ . We need the following version of the handle addition lemma.

**Lemma 2.5.** *Let  $F$  be a surface on the boundary of a 3-manifold  $X$ , let  $K$  a 1-manifold in  $F$  with  $F - K$  compressible in  $X$ , and let  $c$  be a simple loop in  $F - K$ . If  $F_c$  has a compressing disk  $\Delta$  in  $X_c$ , then  $F - c$  has a compressing disk  $\Delta'$  in  $X$  such that  $\partial\Delta' \cap K \subset \partial\Delta \cap K$ .*

*Proof.* This was proved in [Wu 1992a, Theorem 1], which says that under the hypotheses of the lemma we have  $|\partial\Delta' \cap K| \leq |\partial\Delta \cap K|$ , but that was proved by showing that  $\partial\Delta' \cap K \subset \partial\Delta \cap K$ . When  $K = \emptyset$ , this reduces to Jaco's Handle Addition Lemma [1984, Lemma 1].  $\square$

**Lemma 2.6.** *A tangle  $(W, t)$  is completely tubing compressible if and only if the exterior of any nontrivial subgraph of  $\hat{t}$  in  $\widehat{W}$  is a handlebody.*

*Proof.* Let  $A_i$  denote the annulus  $\partial N(\alpha_i) \cap \partial X$ . The exterior of a subgraph  $\Gamma'$  of  $\Gamma = \hat{t}$  in  $\widehat{W}$  is the same as the exterior of the corresponding strands of  $t$  in  $W$ , which can be obtained from  $X = W - \eta(t)$  by attaching 2-handles to those annuli  $A_i$  corresponding to the edges  $e_i$  in  $\Gamma - \Gamma'$ . Therefore the condition that the exterior of any nontrivial subgraph of  $\hat{t}$  in  $\widehat{W}$  is a handlebody implies that attaching 2-handles to  $X$  along any proper subset of  $\bigcup A_i$  yields a handlebody. By [Gordon 1987, Theorem 1] this implies that any proper subset of  $\bigcup A_i$  is a primitive set on  $\partial X$ . Hence  $(W, t)$  is completely tubing compressible.

On the other hand, if  $(W, t)$  is completely tubing compressible, and  $\Gamma'$  is a proper subgraph of  $\Gamma$  which does not contain the edge  $e_i$ , say, then the set  $\bigcup_{j \neq i} A_j$  is primitive on  $\partial X$ , and since the exterior  $E(\Gamma')$  of  $\Gamma'$  can be obtained by attaching 2-handles to  $X$  along a subset of primitive set  $\bigcup_{j \neq i} A_j$ , it follows that  $E(\Gamma')$  is a handlebody.  $\square$



*Proof of Theorem 1.2.* By Lemma 2.1 we need only show that if the exterior of any nontrivial subgraph of  $\Gamma$  is a handlebody then  $\Gamma$  is standard. Let  $W = M - \eta(v)$ , let  $t = W \cap \Gamma$ , let  $X = M - \eta(\Gamma) = W - \eta(t)$ , and let  $P = \partial W \cap X$ . By Lemma 2.2 we may assume that  $P$  is incompressible, so by Lemma 2.6 and [Menasco and Zhang 2001, Lemma 1], the manifold  $M$  is a lens space  $L(p, q)$ . Up to homeomorphism we may assume that  $1 \leq q \leq p/2$ .

By Lemma 2.4 we may assume that  $n \geq 3$ , and by induction we may assume that any nontrivial proper subgraph of  $\Gamma$  is standard. In particular, each  $e_i$  is standard in  $M$ , so it is isotopic to a core of either  $V_1$  or  $V_2$ . Since  $n \geq 3$ , at least two of the  $e_i$  are cores of the same  $V_j$ , hence up to relabeling we may assume without loss of generality that  $e_1$  and  $e_2$  are both isotopic to a core of  $V_2$ .

Consider the graph  $\Gamma' = e_1 \cup \dots \cup e_{n-1}$ . By induction  $\Gamma'$  is standard, so the edges are contained in two  $v$ -disks if  $M = L(p, q)$  with  $2 \leq q < p/2$ , and one  $v$ -disk otherwise. Notice that in the first case the core of  $V_1$  is homotopic to  $q$  times the core of  $V_2$ , so they represent different elements in  $\pi_1 M$ . Since by assumption  $e_1$  and  $e_2$  are isotopic to the core of  $V_2$ , it follows that they are on the same  $v$ -disk. In either case there is a  $v$ -disk  $D_1$  containing both  $e_1$  and  $e_2$ . Taking a subdisk bounded by  $e_1 \cup e_2$  and pushing its interior off  $D_1$ , we get a  $v$ -disk  $D_2$  bounded by  $e_1 \cup e_2$  with interior disjoint from  $\Gamma'$ . Note that  $D_2$  may intersect  $e_n$ . However, the following lemma says that  $D_2$  can be rechosen to have interior disjoint from  $e_n$  as well.

**Lemma 2.7.** *There is a  $v$ -disk  $D_3$  bounded by  $e_1 \cup e_2$  with interior disjoint from  $\Gamma$ .*

*Proof.* Consider the handlebody  $X = M - \eta(\Gamma)$ . Let  $c_i$  be the meridian curve of  $e_i$  on  $F = \partial X$ , and put  $C = \{c_1, \dots, c_n\}$ . Let  $K = c_1 \cup \dots \cup c_{n-1}$ . By Lemma 2.2, the tangle  $(W, t)$  is completely tubing compressible, so  $K$  is a primitive set on  $\partial X$ , hence  $F - K$  is compressible. We now apply Lemma 2.6 to  $(X, F, K, c)$  with  $c = c_n$ . After attaching a 2-handle to  $c_n$ , the manifold  $X' = X_{c_n}$  is the same as the exterior of the graph  $\Gamma' = e_1 \cup \dots \cup e_{n-1}$ , and the surface  $F_{c_n}$  is  $\partial X'$ .

Recall that  $e_1 \cup e_2$  bounds a  $v$ -disk  $D_2$  in  $M$  with interior disjoint from  $\Gamma'$ , so its restriction to  $X' = X_{c_n}$  is a compressing disk  $\Delta$  of  $\partial X' = F_{c_n}$  intersecting each of  $c_1$  and  $c_2$  at a single point, and is disjoint from  $c_3, \dots, c_{n-1}$ . Therefore, by Lemma 2.6, there is a compressing disk  $\Delta'$  of  $F - c_n$  in  $X$ , such that  $\partial \Delta'$  intersects each of  $c_1$  and  $c_2$  at most once, and is disjoint from  $c_3, \dots, c_{n-1}$ . Since it is a compressing disk of  $F - c_n$ , it is also disjoint from  $c_n$ .

Now  $\partial \Delta'$  cannot be disjoint from  $C$ , because we have assumed that the surface  $P$  homotopic to  $F - C$  is incompressible. Also,  $\partial \Delta' \cap C$  cannot be a single point in  $c_1$ , say, because then the frontier of a regular neighborhood of  $\Delta' \cup c_1$  would be a compressing disk of  $F - C$ , which is again a contradiction. It follows that  $\partial \Delta'$  intersects each of  $c_1$  and  $c_2$  at exactly one point, and is disjoint from all the other

$c_j$ . Since  $\Gamma$  is a spine of  $N(\Gamma)$ , by shrinking  $N(\Gamma)$  to  $\Gamma$ , the disk  $\Delta'$  becomes a  $v$ -disk  $D_3$  in  $M$  bounded by  $e_1 \cup e_2$ , with interior disjoint from  $\Gamma$ . This completes the proof of the lemma.  $\square$

We now continue the proof that  $\Gamma$  is standard in  $M$ . By induction we may assume that  $\Gamma'' = e_2 \cup \cdots \cup e_n$  is in standard position in  $M = V_1 \cup V_2$ , with  $e_2$  on a  $v$ -disk  $D'$  in  $V_2$ , say, which contains all the edges of  $\Gamma''$  in  $V_2$ . Consider the disk  $D_3$  bounded by  $e_1 \cup e_2$  as given by Lemma 2.7. It has interior disjoint from  $\Gamma$ , so by considering  $D_3 \cap D'$  and using an innermost-circle-outermost-arc argument one can show that  $D_3$  can be modified so that it intersects  $D'$  only along the edge  $e_2$ . Pushing the part of  $D_3$  near  $e_2$  slightly off  $e_2$ , we get a  $v$ -disk  $D_4$  with boundary the union of  $e_1$  and a loop  $e'_1$  on  $D'$ , which is a parallel copy of  $e_2$  intersecting  $\Gamma$  only at  $v$ . One can then isotope  $e_1$  via the disk  $D_4$  to the edge  $e'_1$ , which lies on the  $v$ -disk  $D'$ . Thus after this isotopy all edges of  $\Gamma$  are now contained in the  $v$ -disks which contain  $\Gamma''$ . Therefore  $\Gamma$  is also standard by definition.  $\square$

*Proof of Theorem 1.1.* Suppose  $(W, t)$  is completely tubing compressible. Then by Lemma 2.6 the corresponding graph  $\hat{t}$  in  $\hat{W} = W \cup B$  has the property that the exterior of any proper subgraph of  $\hat{t}$  is a handlebody. By Theorem 1.2,  $\hat{t}$  is contained in the union of at most two  $v$ -disks  $D_1$  and  $D_2$ , with  $D_i$  in  $V_i$ . By an isotopy rel  $\hat{t}$  we may assume that  $D_i \cap \partial W$  consists of two arcs, hence  $D_1 \cap W$  and  $D_2 \cap W$  are two disjoint bands in  $W$  containing  $t$ , and the result follows.  $\square$

### Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Menasco and Zhang for raising the problems, and for posing an insightful conjecture [2001, Conjecture 5].

### References

- [Bonahon and Otal 1982] F. Bonahon and J.-P. Otal, “Scindements de Heegaard des espaces lenticulaires”, *C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris Sér. I Math.* **294**:17 (1982), 585–587. MR 83f:57008 Zbl 0502.57006
- [Culler et al. 1987] M. Culler, C. M. Gordon, J. Luecke, and P. B. Shalen, “Dehn surgery on knots”, *Ann. of Math. (2)* **125**:2 (1987), 237–300. MR 88a:57026 Zbl 0633.57006
- [Gordon 1987] C. M. Gordon, “On primitive sets of loops in the boundary of a handlebody”, *Topology Appl.* **27**:3 (1987), 285–299. MR 88k:57013 Zbl 0634.57007
- [Jaco 1984] W. Jaco, “Adding a 2-handle to a 3-manifold: an application to property  $R$ ”, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **92**:2 (1984), 288–292. MR 86b:57006 Zbl 0564.57009
- [Menasco and Zhang 2001] W. Menasco and X. Zhang, “Notes on tangles, 2-handle additions and exceptional Dehn fillings”, *Pacific J. Math.* **198**:1 (2001), 149–174. MR 2002f:57012 Zbl 1049.57013
- [Scharlemann and Thompson 1991] M. Scharlemann and A. Thompson, “Detecting unknotted graphs in 3-space”, *J. Differential Geom.* **34**:2 (1991), 539–560. MR 93a:57012 Zbl 0751.05033

- [Schultens 1993] J. Schultens, “The classification of Heegaard splittings for (compact orientable surface) $\times S^1$ ”, *Proc. London Math. Soc.* (3) **67**:2 (1993), 425–448. MR 94d:57043 Zbl 0789.57012
- [Waldhausen 1968] F. Waldhausen, “Heegaard-Zerlegungen der 3-Sphäre”, *Topology* **7** (1968), 195–203. MR 37 #3576 Zbl 0157.54501
- [Wu 1992a] Y. Q. Wu, “A generalization of the handle addition theorem”, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **114**:1 (1992), 237–242. MR 92c:57018 Zbl 0737.57007
- [Wu 1992b] Y. Q. Wu, “On planarity of graphs in 3-manifolds”, *Comment. Math. Helv.* **67**:4 (1992), 635–647. MR 93m:57002 Zbl 0812.57005
- [Wu 2004] Y.-Q. Wu, “The classification of Dehn fillings on the outer torus of a 1-bridge braid exterior which produce solid tori”, *Math. Ann.* **330**:1 (2004), 1–15. MR MR2091675 Zbl 1055.57030

Received February 4, 2002. Revised January 6, 2003.

YING-QING WU  
DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS  
UNIVERSITY OF IOWA  
IOWA CITY, IA 52242  
wu@math.uiowa.edu

